


▼ User Menu 

Home (/user/myprofile)	Assigned Editor	Danae Yu
Manage Accounts (/user/manage_accounts)	Journal	Forests
Change Password (/user/chgpwd)	Manuscript Status	Website online
Edit Profile (/user/edit)	Manuscript ID	forests-2154036
Logout (/user/logout)	Type	Article
	Recruiting Reviewers	yes
	Title	Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia (https://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/14/3/652)

▼ Submissions Menu 

Submit Manuscript (/user/manuscripts/upload)	Manuscript	manuscript.docx (/user/manuscripts/displayFile/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9)
Display Submitted Manuscripts (/user/manuscripts/status)	Manuscript	manuscript.pdf (/user/manuscripts/displayFile/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9/final-format-manuscript)
English Editing (/user/pre_english_article/status)	Manuscript	manuscript-english.pdf (/user/english/displayFile/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9/manuscript-english-pdf)
Discount Vouchers (/user/discount_voucher)	Authors	Dr A. Mujetahid * mujetahid@unhas.ac.id D Forest Harve...
Invoices (/user/invoices)	Authors	Mr Munajat Nursaputra munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id D Forestry Plan...
LaTeX Word Count (/user/get/latex_word_count)	Authors	Dr Andang Suryana Soma s_andangs@unhas.ac.id D Watershed M...
	Section	Forest Inventory, Modeling and Remote Sensing (https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/sections/forest_inventory_modeling_remote_sensing)
	Special Issue	Remote Sensing Approaches to Mapping and Monitoring Forest Vegetation Conditions (https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/special_issues/L9XZ43ZVF3)

▼ Reviewers Menu 

Reviews (/user/reviewer/status)	Author Contributions	Conceptualization, A. Mujetahid and Munajat Nursaputra; Methodology, A. Mujetahid and Munajat Nursaputra; Software, Munajat Nursaputra; Validation, Munajat Nursaputra and Andang Suryana Soma; Formal analysis, A. Mujetahid and Munajat Nursaputra; Investigation, Munajat Nursaputra; Resources, Munajat Nursaputra; Data curation, Munajat Nursaputra; Writing –
------------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------



Volunteer
Preferences
(/volunteer_reviewer_info/view)

original draft, A. Mujetahid and Munajat Nursaputra; Writing – review & editing, A. Mujetahid, Munajat Nursaputra and Andang Suryana Soma; Visualization, Munajat Nursaputra; Supervision, A. Mujetahid and Andang Suryana Soma; Project administration, A. Mujetahid; Funding acquisition, A. Mujetahid.

Coverletter	coverletter.v1.pdf (/user/manuscripts/displayFile/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9/coverletter)
Number of Words	4222
Submission Received	26 December 2022
QC passed	
Submission Revision Date	02 March 2023
Accepted	18 March 2023
Published	22 March 2023

© 1996-2023 MDPI (Basel, Switzerland) unless otherwise stated

Disclaimer **Terms and Conditions**
(<https://www.mdpi.com/about/terms-and-conditions>)
Privacy Policy (<https://www.mdpi.com/about/privacy>)





A. Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

[Forests] Manuscript ID: forests-2154036 - Major Revisions

1 message

Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

Wed, Feb 15, 2023 at 8:32 AM

Reply-To: danae.yu@mdpi.com

To: Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

Cc: Munajat Nursaputra <munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id>, Andang Suryana Soma <s_andangs@unhas.ac.id>, Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Mujetahid,

Thank you again for your manuscript submission:

Manuscript ID: forests-2154036

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia

Authors: Mujetahid Mujetahid *, Munajat Nursaputra, Andang Suryana Soma

Received: 26 December 2022

E-mails: mujetahid@unhas.ac.id, munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id, s_andangs@unhas.ac.id

Submitted to section: Forest Inventory, Modeling and Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/sections/forest_inventory_modeling_remote_sensing

Remote Sensing Approaches to Mapping and Monitoring Forest Vegetation Conditions

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/special_issues/L9XZ43ZVF3

Your manuscript has now been reviewed by experts in the field. Please find your manuscript with the referee reports at this link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9>

Please revise the manuscript according to the referees' comments and upload the revised file within 7 days.

Please use the version of your manuscript found at the above link for your revisions.

(I) Please check that all references are relevant to the contents of the manuscript.

(II) Any revisions to the manuscript should be marked up using the "Track Changes" function if you are using MS Word/LaTeX, such that any changes can be easily viewed by the editors and reviewers.

(III) Please provide a cover letter to explain, point by point, the details of the revisions to the manuscript and your responses to the referees' comments.

(IV) If you found it impossible to address certain comments in the review reports, please include an explanation in your appeal.

(V) The revised version will be sent to the editors and reviewers.

If one of the referees has suggested that your manuscript should undergo extensive English revisions, please address this issue during revision. We propose that you use one of the editing services listed at <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/english> or have your manuscript checked by a native English-speaking colleague.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the revision of your manuscript. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,
Danae Yu
Assistant Editor
E-mail: danae.yu@mdpi.com

--

Danae Yu
MDPI Branch Office, Wuhan
No. 88, Youkeyuan Road, Fenghuo Technology Building, 7nd Floor,
430064 Wuhan , Hubei Province, China.
Tel. 02759615275
Forests Editorial Office

Forests Statistics
IF (2021): 3.282, Rank Q1(Forestry)
CiteScore (2021): 4.0, Rank Q1(Forestry)

Join @Forests_MDPI channel on Twitter, LinkedIn and Facebook to explore our latest updates.

Forests 2022 Early Career Investigator Award
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/awards/2123>

Forests 2022 Best PhD Thesis Award
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/awards/2080>

Highly Cited Papers Published in 2021:

Modeling and Optimization Sustainable Forest Supply Chain Considering Discount in Transportation System and Supplier Selection under Uncertainty
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/8/964>

Xylem Phenology and Growth Response of European Beech, Silver Fir and Scots Pine along an Elevational Gradient during the Extreme Drought Year 2018
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/1/75>

Modelling the Material Resistance of Wood—Part 2: Validation and Optimization of the Meyer-Veltrup Model
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/5/576>

MDPI
Forests Editorial Office
Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland
Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel
E-mail: forests@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/>

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.



A. Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

[Forests] Manuscript ID: forests-2154036 - Manuscript Resubmitted

1 message

Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

Thu, Mar 2, 2023 at 5:03 PM

Reply-To: Danae Yu <danae.yu@mdpi.com>, Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

To: Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

Cc: Munajat Nursaputra <munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id>, Andang Suryana Soma <s_andangs@unhas.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Mujetahid,

Thank you very much for resubmitting the modified version of the following manuscript:

Manuscript ID: forests-2154036

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia

Authors: Mujetahid Mujetahid *, Munajat Nursaputra, Andang Suryana Soma

Received: 26 December 2022

E-mails: mujetahid@unhas.ac.id, munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id, s_andangs@unhas.ac.id

Submitted to section: Forest Inventory, Modeling and Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/sections/forest_inventory_modeling_remote_sensing

Remote Sensing Approaches to Mapping and Monitoring Forest Vegetation Conditions

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/special_issues/L9XZ43ZVF3https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9

A member of the editorial office will be in touch with you soon regarding progress of the manuscript.

Kind regards,

Forests Editorial Office

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland

Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, CH-4052 Basel

Tel. +41 61 683 77 34 (office)

E-mail: forests@mdpi.com<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/>

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



A. Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

[Forests] Manuscript ID: forests-2154036 - Accepted for Publication

1 message

Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

Sat, Mar 18, 2023 at 11:17 PM

Reply-To: Danae Yu <danae.yu@mdpi.com>, Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

To: Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

Cc: Munajat Nursaputra <munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id>, Andang Suryana Soma <s_andangs@unhas.ac.id>, Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>, Danae Yu <danae.yu@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Mujetahid,

Congratulations on the acceptance of your manuscript, and thank you for submitting your work to Forests:

Manuscript ID: forests-2154036

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia

Authors: Mujetahid Mujetahid *, Munajat Nursaputra, Andang Suryana Soma

Received: 26 December 2022

E-mails: mujetahid@unhas.ac.id, munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id, s_andangs@unhas.ac.id

Submitted to section: Forest Inventory, Modeling and Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/sections/forest_inventory_modeling_remote_sensing

Remote Sensing Approaches to Mapping and Monitoring Forest Vegetation Conditions

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/special_issues/L9XZ43ZVF3https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9

We will now edit and finalize your paper, which will then be returned to you for your approval. Within the next couple of days, an invoice concerning the article processing charge (APC) for publication in this open access journal will be sent by email from the Editorial Office in Basel, Switzerland.

If, however, extensive English edits are required to your manuscript, we will need to return the paper requesting improvements throughout.

We encourage you to set up your profile at SciProfiles.com, MDPI's researcher network platform. Articles you publish with MDPI will be linked to your SciProfiles page, where colleagues and peers will be able to see all of your publications, citations, as well as other academic contributions.

We also invite you to contribute to Encyclopedia (<https://encyclopedia.pub>), a scholarly platform providing accurate information about the latest research results. You can adapt parts of your paper to provide valuable reference information, via Encyclopedia, for others both within the field and beyond.

Kind regards,

Dawn Shao

Managing Editor

E-mail: dawn.shao@mdpi.com-----
Forests Statistics

IF (2021): 3.282, Rank Q1(Forestry)

CiteScore (2021): 4.0, Rank Q1(Forestry)

Join @Forests_MDPI channel on Twitter, LinkedIn and Facebook to explore our latest updates.

Forests 2022 Early Career Investigator Award
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/awards/2123>

Forests 2022 Best PhD Thesis Award
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/awards/2080>

Highly Cited Papers Published in 2021:

A Transfer Residual Neural Network Based on ResNet-34 for Detection of Wood Knot Defects
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/2/212>

Assessment of Carbon Stock in Forest Biomass and Emission Reduction Potential in Malaysia
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/10/1294>

Construction and Optimization of an Urban Ecological Security Pattern Based on Habitat Quality Assessment and the Minimum Cumulative Resistance Model in Shenzhen City, China
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/7/847>

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.



A. Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

[Forests] Manuscript ID: forests-2154036 - Final Proofreading Before Publication

1 message

Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

Mon, Mar 20, 2023 at 9:43 AM

Reply-To: Danae Yu <danae.yu@mdpi.com>, Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>

To: Mujetahid M <mujetahid@unhas.ac.id>

Cc: Munajat Nursaputra <munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id>, Andang Suryana Soma <s_andangs@unhas.ac.id>, Forests Editorial Office <forests@mdpi.com>, danae.yu@mdpi.com

Dear Dr. Mujetahid,

We invite you to proofread your manuscript to ensure that this is the final version that can be published and confirm that you will require no further changes:

At MDPI, we believe in the fast dissemination of sound, valid scientific knowledge. Once accepted for publication, we aim to ensure that research is published as soon as possible.

Please upload the final proofread version of your manuscript within 24 hours, and please remember that we are able to be flexible with this timeframe should you alert us. If you need more time, please inform the Assistant Editor of the expected date that you will be able to return the proofread version.

Manuscript ID: forests-2154036

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia

Authors: Mujetahid Mujetahid *, Munajat Nursaputra, Andang Suryana Soma

Received: 26 December 2022

E-mails: mujetahid@unhas.ac.id, munajatnursaputra@unhas.ac.id, s_andangs@unhas.ac.id

Submitted to section: Forest Inventory, Modeling and Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/sections/forest_inventory_modeling_remote_sensing

Remote Sensing Approaches to Mapping and Monitoring Forest Vegetation Conditions

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/special_issues/L9XZ43ZVF3

Please read the following instructions carefully before proofreading:

1) Download the manuscript from the link provided at the end of this message and upload the final proofed version via the second link. If you experience any difficulties, please contact the Forests Editorial Office.

2) Please use Microsoft Word's built-in track changes function to highlight any changes you make, or send a comprehensive list of changes in a separate document. Note that this is the *last chance* to make textual changes to the manuscript. Some style and formatting changes may have been made by the production team, please do not revert these changes.

3) All authors must agree to the final version. Check carefully that authors' names and affiliations are correct, and that funding sources are correctly acknowledged. Incorrect author names or affiliations are picked up by indexing databases, such as the Web of Science or PubMed, and can be difficult to correct.

After proofreading, final production will be carried out. Note that changes to the position of figures and tables may occur during the final steps.

Changes can be made to a paper published online only at the discretion of the Editorial Office.

Please confirm whether you would like to use the Open Review option already selected, where the review reports and authors' responses are published alongside your paper. Reviewers can also choose to identify themselves along with the published paper. We encourage authors to take advantage of this option as proof of the rigorous peer review process used to publish your research. Please confirm again that you approve the use of Open Review for your paper via the uploading page.

Please download the final version of your paper for proofreading here:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/proof/file/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9>

and upload here:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/bfe401616d3a3304f3a9b00e4b5a7db9>

This manuscript includes supplementary materials, which you can find at the second link, above. Please note that citations and references in Supplementary files are permitted provided that they also appear in the reference list of the main text. Please ensure that you proofread your supplementary materials and upload them together with the manuscript.

We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,
Danae Yu
Assistant Editor
E-mail: danae.yu@mdpi.com

--

Danae Yu
MDPI Branch Office, Wuhan
No. 88, Youkeyuan Road, Fenghuo Technology Building, 7nd Floor,
430064 Wuhan , Hubei Province, China.
Tel. 02759615275
Forests Editorial Office

Forests Statistics
IF (2021): 3.282, Rank Q1(Forestry)
CiteScore (2021): 4.0, Rank Q1(Forestry)

Join @Forests_MDPI channel on Twitter, LinkedIn and Facebook to explore our latest updates.

Forests 2022 Early Career Investigator Award
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/awards/2123>

Forests 2022 Best PhD Thesis Award
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/awards/2080>

Highly Cited Papers Published in 2021:

A Transfer Residual Neural Network Based on ResNet-34 for Detection of Wood Knot Defects
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/2/212>

Assessment of Carbon Stock in Forest Biomass and Emission Reduction Potential in Malaysia
<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/10/1294>

Construction and Optimization of an Urban Ecological Security Pattern Based on Habitat Quality Assessment and the Minimum Cumulative Resistance Model in Shenzhen City, China

<http://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/12/7/847>

MDPI

Forests Editorial Office

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland

Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel

E-mail: forests@mdpi.com

<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/forests/>

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

Reviewer Comments	Author Comments
<p>REVIEWER 1:</p> <p>This paper has an interesting topic, but it is still not feasible to proceed to the next process. Several researchers have published the use of GEE in detecting deforestation, including the effects of illegal logging. In the introduction, the authors do not justify the research's importance. There is no visible improvement in the use of GEE in similar cases. In this section, the authors should convey the advantages of using Sentinel images in detecting forest-cover changes over a certain period compared to identical satellite images. Information on Sentinel's resolution and repeat cycle will be important in the speed of detecting changes in forest cover.</p> <p>Weaknesses are most often found in the method section. In the method section, the authors should include a flow chart of the method used in this study (Line 117). Regarding the scope of the study, the authors should limit the research location only to the state forest area (Line 86). The definition of illegal logging is not stated in the method, and illegal logging should be limited only to state forest areas that previously had forest cover. The authors do not explain the number of sentinel scenes used and the date of coverage in each observation period (3 periods) (Line 96). The period of observing images is too long (4 months for each period). Illegal logging detection should be carried out between the shortest possible periods, for example, every two weeks or every month following the cycle/duration of satellite imagery. This aims to quickly detect illegal logging incidents so that it helps overcome the lack of human resources in the field.</p> <p>The validation method is also not appropriately explained in how authors validate: a. Forest cover Vs non-forest cover; b. deforestation due to Illegal logging Vs deforestation due to non-illegal logging. How many of each is the sample number, and how is it determined?</p> <p>This paper is also weak in terms of citations. Many statements are not supported by related references, for example, in lines 67-72, 89-93, 95, 128-141, 153-156</p> <p>In the results section, there are 1971 and 1680 spots of illegal logging with a total area of 7599.28 ha. There is no explanation for the spot number and the area of illegal logging events monitored by the Sulawesi Regional Environment and Forestry Law Enforcement Centre. The authors only show a few points of illegal logging incidents on the map of research locations (Figure 1). Based on the map of the illegal logging area, this paper will be more useful if the authors can provide forest conditions that are prone to illegal logging incidents.</p> <p>Some paragraphs are not related to the topic of discussion, such as in lines 215-248 (should convey the results of forest cover identification in 3 periods along with validation), lines</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Comment 1 regarding the importance of research we add in the introduction, that for tropical regions such as Indonesia the use of Sentinel imagery data for forest monitoring is very new and is indeed very much needed to make observations in an area without any cloud disturbance. 2. Comment 2, this research is indeed limited to forested areas in the forest area and we focus on forest areas in South Sulawesi Province, as we present at the research location. In GEE, we immediately issued data information per study area so that the image scene was not depicted. This is indeed different if we download directly to the image provider's website. For the duration of monitoring, we do it to see the conditions in advance in a year so we divide it into several observation periods to validate it with illegal logging monitoring data in the field. But it's a good suggestion to do it every month, and we will develop the algorithm on GEE even further in future research. 3. Comment 3 regarding the validation performed in the GEE platform using the Kappa accuracy test. As for the accuracy test data, it uses data from related agencies in Indonesia that monitor illegal logging incidents in the field. We then analyze the event monitoring point data to measure the accuracy of the model. 4. Comment 5, regarding illegal logging monitoring points obtained from the Sulawesi Regional Environment and Forestry Law Enforcement Centre, the number is presented in the validation section. 5. Comment 6, we think the explanation regarding the results in the Identification of Illegal Logging Events section is a reflection of the results of the research described in the two observation periods.

258-281 (should display illegal logging areas between the two periods, accompanied by validation results), line 312-316.

Based on the weaknesses of the method used and deficiencies in the presentation of the analysis, the authors had to re-analyze and be able to rearrange the manuscript.

Reviewer Comments	Author Comments
<p>REVIEWER 2: The authors used sentinel 1 and 2 for monitoring logging in within the google earth engine (GEE). As for me, the topic is so interesting but the novelties are not clear and the presentation could be much better it is. I have some major revisions that the author should be addressed in the paper up to this could be more interesting and publishable.</p> <p>1- The abstract was not well presented, especially its first 5 lines. Please highlights key content areas, your research purpose, the relevance or importance of your work, and the main outcomes.</p> <p>2- The novelties of the presented manuscript are limited or not clearly mentioned in the last paragraph of the introduction. please clarify the novelties in more detail in the last paragraph of the paper. the early monitoring of illegal logging is one of the most important case studies in GEE, as well. please see the following link: https://earthengine.google.com/case_studies/</p> <p>3- please cite the following paper for the explanation on Page 2, Line --. https://doi.org/10.1109/JSTARS.2020.3021052 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.isprsjprs.2020.04.001</p> <p>4- I couldn't see any workflow for the methodology. The methodology is the heart of the paper that didn't well present.</p> <p>5- The author used some GEE script in the paper that is not commented on in the scientific journal. please refer readers to the available code on the specific URL.</p> <p>6- About the validation, Please shows the condition matrix in a table.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Comment 1, we provide an explanation regarding the importance of this research that the lack of monitoring of overall forest conditions is the impact of the current high forest destruction. Through this research, the problems encountered related to environmental damage due to illegal logging will be illustrated through the use of remote sensing technology which is currently highly developed based on artificial intelligence and machine learning, namely the Google Earth Engine (GEE). 2. Comment 2 regarding the novelty of this research, is that this is a new-research in the use of cloud computing technology, especially in Indonesia for forest monitoring. Of course, in the future this platform will not only serve as research but will be used by related agencies for their work. 3. Comment 3, regarding the suggested article, we have added it as an explanation in our manuscript. 4. Comment 6, validation is carried out in the GEE platform which immediately issues the accuracy test value.

Reviewer Comments	Author Comments
<p>REVIEWER 3: Overall, the article Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia can be accepted with correction as mentioned below.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Authors are required to add one more section that discussed about the Related work or Literature Review. This section should be written as 2.0 Related Work. the 3.0 Materials and Methods and follow to other section. 2. Materials and Methods, is good if author can draw a methodology diagram and explain it. Easy for another researcher to understand. 3. Figure 5, the colour used to differentiate between Non-Forest Estate and Forest Protection need to be change. 4. Need to clarify whether the statement "The era of forestry 4.0 should facilitate easy forestry monitoring, especially in data acquisition and analysis [42, 43]." Please confirm "the era of forestry 4.0 ..." 5. "..... the average comparison of VV and VH polarisation images," Please state what is VV and VH. 6. Is good if author can show the results in Table form and explain from that Table. 7. "Most of the illegal logging incidents in Sulawesi Selatan occur in undesignated forest areas, as shown in Figure 8." There is no Figure 8 in this article. Please read back and author required to improve it. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Comments on section 3, for the colors between non-forest estate and forest protection are different. 2. Comments on section 4, Forestry Era 4.0 is a forestry development concept that is being promoted in Indonesia as support for the industrial era 4.0. Where this era is expected in management and forestry to keep up with the times by using existing technological developments, especially in the field of mapping which is developing based on cloud computing. 3. Comments on section 5, VV and VH are the polarization of Sentinel 1 radar images. VV where the satellite transmits waves vertically and receives vertically while VH where the satellite transmits waves vertically and receives horizontally. This polarization is a band to extract object information. However, because the Radar Image only has one channel, to extract the information is to adjust the polarization. 4. Comments on section 7, for Figure 8 have been corrected

Reviewer Comments	Author Comments
<p>REVIEWER 4: In the manuscript entitled "Monitoring Illegal Logging using Google Earth Engine in Sulawesi Selatan Tropical Forest, Indonesia" submitted to Forest journal, the authors used Google Earth Engine (GEE) to monitor illegal logging. The authors used the random forest classification algorithm of the GEE platform to obtain data on forest conditions for 2021, covering an area of 2,843,938.87 ha or 63% of the total area of Sulawesi Selatan Province. The article is within the Forest scope and provides useful information for the journal readers. I recommend the publication after major revisions.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Abstract section is not summarizing well the key points of the research work. The findings/importance of this research should be presented in one sentence at the end of this abstract section. Please clarify the contradictory meaning of the following statements: Getting satellite imagery with relatively small cloud cover for tropical regions, such as Indonesia, is remarkably difficult. This difficulty is due to the presence of a radar sensor on Sentinel 1 images that can penetrate clouds, allowing the observation of the forest condition even in the presence of clouds. 2. The authors reviewed the state of the art regarding the works done in the past and the current needs of improvement, in the introduction section. Here are some other articles to improve this section: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/ffgc.2022.1018762/full, https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0303243421002397, https://www.mdpi.com/1999-4907/11/12/1283, https://www.fs.usda.gov/rm/pubs_journals/2021/rmrs_2021_chen_s001.pdf. 3. The data collection section should be rewritten, better explained. The GEE platform is adequate to the purpose of the article. The datasets are covering the Sulawesi Selatan Province of Indonesia covering an area of 2,843,938.87 ha of tropical forest. 4. In the results and discussion section, the authors successfully determined the forest cover and the illegal logging sites. Their results show that most of the illegal logging events monitored in the field revealed a high conformity with the results of illegal logging identification produced from their GEE platform. 5. The key research conclusions should be more emphasized. Conclusion section should be extended and the correlation to the research results better explained. 7. The references cited must be checked again for the journal standards. Reference 5 is not clear. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Comments to part 1, Indonesia is a tropical country where land monitoring using remote sensing data has many obstacles, especially in multispectral images where almost every time every area, especially forested areas, is always covered with clouds. So that the presence of radar images such as Sentinel 1 can help to overcome these problems because Sentinel 1 images can minimize cloud disturbances. With the availability of this image database on GEE it is very helpful in monitoring. This research aims to optimize the role of GIS platforms such as GEE to be used in monitoring the condition of areas, especially forests. 2. Comments 2, 5 and 7, we make improvements to the citations and add explanations.

